

Table 4.3-2. Summary of Comparative Analysis for Remedial Alternatives

Remedial Alternative	Description	Threshold Criteria		Balancing Criteria				
		Overall Protection of Human Health and the Environment	Compliance with ARARs	Long-Term Effectiveness and Permanence	Reduction of Toxicity, Mobility, or Volume through Treatment	Short-Term Effectiveness	Implementability	Present Value Cost (Dollars)
Contaminated Sediment Alternatives								
A	No Action/No Further Action	—	—	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
B	Dredge 83 acres; Contain 4 acres Dredge/Cap 3 acres; EMNR 103 acres MNR 2,250 acres; In-situ 7 acres Ex-situ 321,120 cy; Disposal 892,000 cy	+	+	○	◐	◐	●	\$
D	Dredge 161 acres; Contain 7 acres Dredge/Cap 6 acres; EMNR 88 acres MNR 2,185 acres; In-situ 3 acres Ex-situ 395,060 cy; Disposal 1,766,000 cy	+	+	◑	◑	◐	●	\$
E	Dredge 249 acres; Contain 10 acres Dredge/Cap 10 acres; EMNR 60 acres MNR 2,121 acres; In-situ 0 acres Ex-situ 431,560 cy; Disposal 3,100,000 cy	+	+	◑	◐	●	◑	\$\$
F	Dredge 479 acres; Contain 18 acres Dredge/Cap 17 acres; EMNR 24 acres MNR 1,913 acres; In-situ 0 acres Ex-situ 495,830 cy; Disposal 7,115,000 cy	+	+	◐	●	◐	◑	\$\$\$
G	Dredge 741 acres; Contain 22 acres Dredge/Cap 18 acres; EMNR 15 acres MNR 1,655 acres; In-situ 0 acres Ex-situ 518,010 cy; Disposal 11,722,000 cy	+	+	●	●	◑	○	\$\$\$\$

Legend for Qualitative Ratings System:

Threshold Criteria	Balancing Criteria (Relative Performance of Criterion)	Balancing Criteria - Cost (Present Value Cost in Dollars)
— Unacceptable		
+ Acceptable	○ Least	\$ \$500M through \$1,000M
	◐ Low	\$\$ \$1,000M through \$2,000M
	◑ Moderate	\$\$\$ \$2,000M through \$3,000M
	◑ Better	\$\$\$\$ Greater than \$3,000M
	● Best	

